

## EMPLOYMENT LINKAGES AND STRUCTURAL CHANGES IN SINGAPORE

## ABSTRACT


#### Abstract

This paper studies the employment linkages in the Singapore economy using the input-output framework for 18 industrial sectors at 2-digit industrial classification. Using the 1995 and 2000 input-output tables, this paper generates a detailed breakdown of how a change in final demand in an industry creates employment within that industry as well as in other industries. The findings have allowed for an explicit analysis of employment linkages and structural changes in employment creation over time that occur within and between different sectors and industries. The results of the paper indicate the presence of strong employment linkages between different sectors of the economy, especially from the manufacturing to services sectors, but less so in the reverse direction. Such intermediate demand for services by the manufacturing industries would be a key driver towards increasing employment linkages and job creation in the services sector.


## INTRODUCTION

As the Singapore economy evolves towards higher value-added activities, employment creation has shifted from the manufacturing to the services sector. Given that both these sectors form the "twin engines" of growth for the Singapore economy, it is crucial to examine the employment linkages between the two sectors.

Existing literatures showed that there is an increasing role of services for intermediate uses within developed economies (Greenhalgh and Gregory, 2001; Guerrier and Maliciani, 2005; Franke and Kalmbach, 2005). The results suggest that there is a rising demand for intermediate services for production of further services as well strong inter-industry linkages between the various sectors in an economy.

[^0][^1]
## Contributed by:

## A/P Shandre M. Thangavelu

Consultant
Manpower Planning and Policy Division
Ministry of Manpower
Ms Tan Zhen Li
Research Analyst
Manpower Planning and Policy Division
Ministry of Manpower

This paper studies the employment linkages between the manufacturing and services sectors in the Singapore economy using the input-output framework. The input-output framework describes the interrelationship between producers and consumers and the interdependence among the different industries. Using the input-output tables, this paper generates a detailed breakdown of how a change in final demand in an industry creates employment within that industry as well as in other industries. The results obtained will allow for an explicit analysis of employment linkages and structural changes in employment creation over time that occur within and between different sectors and industries.

In brief, the framework calculates employment multipliers ${ }^{2}$ for 18 industrial sectors at 2-digit industrial classification using the 1995 and 2000 IO Tables. A full explanation of the data sources and methodology together with description of the industrial sectors are given in Appendix 1, 2 and 3 respectively.

The results of the paper indicate the presence of strong employment linkages between different sectors of the economy, especially from the manufacturing to services sectors, but less so in the reverse direction. Such intermediate demand for services by the manufacturing industries would be a key driver towards increasing employment linkages and job creation in the services sector.

## EMPLOYMENT LINKAGES

Based on the computed employment multipliers for 1995, 2000 and $2004^{3}$ given in Appendix 4, Exhibits 5, 6 and 7 respectively, the following results on the breakdown of the jobs created arising from a $\$ \$ 1$ billion increase in final demand of each industrial sector's goods or services were obtained:
(a) The share of jobs created outside the same industry from an increase in final demand of that industry is shown to be higher for industries in the manufacturing and services sectors as compared to the construction and others sector ${ }^{4}$ in 1995, 2000 and 2004. The employment spill-over effects from these manufacturing and services industries into other industries are significant. For example, 31 per cent of the jobs created from a $\$ 1$ billion increase in final demand in the electronics industry are intra-industry (within the same industry), while 69 per cent are inter-industry (spill-over to other industries) in 2004 (Exhibit 1).

[^2]
## PERCENTAGE OF INTER AND INTRA-INDUSTRY JOBS CREATED IN SELECTED INDUSTRIES IN SINGAPORE, 2004

[Exhibit 1]

| Increase in Final <br> Demand in | Intra-Industry <br> Jobs Created <br> $(\%)$ | Inter-Industry <br> Jobs Created <br> $(\%)$ |
| :--- | :---: | :---: |
| Electronics | 31.3 | 68.7 |
| Finance | 36.6 | 63.4 |
| Construction | 60.6 | 39.4 |
| Others | 64.7 | 35.4 |

See details in Exhibit 8 at Appendix 4.
(b) The employment spill-over effects from individual manufacturing industries to the services sector as a whole is stronger than from individual services industries to the manufacturing sector as a whole. Generally, the employment spill-over from the manufacturing sector to the services sector is greater than that vice versa (Exhibit 2).

Absolute number of jobs Created within and between SECTORS IN SINGAPORE, 2004
[Exhibit 2]

| Increase of <br> S\$1 Billion in <br> Final Demand <br> in | Total Number <br> Jobs of Created <br> in Manufacturing <br> Sector | Total Number of <br> Jobs Created in <br> Services Sector | Total |
| :--- | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Manufacturing | 67,390 | 39,156 | 106,546 |
| Services | 4,163 | 62,122 | 66,285 |
| Total | 71,553 | 101,278 | 172,831 |

See details in Exhibit 7 at Appendix 4.
(c) There are also a higher number of jobs created by the services industries as a result of spill-over from other services industries, compared to the spill-over effect between industries within the manufacturing sector. In other words, the employment linkages between industries within the services sector are stronger than that between industries within the manufacturing sector (Exhibit 3).

The employment spillover from the manufacturing sector to the services sector is greater than that vice versa.

PERCENTAGE OF OWN, MANUFACTURING AND SERVICES JOBS CREATED IN 2004 FOR SELECTED INDUSTRIES IN SINGAPORE
[Exhibit 3]

| Increase in <br> Final Demand in | Share of Total Jobs (\%) Created in 2004 in |  |  |
| :--- | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | Intra-Industry <br> Own <br> Industry | Inter-Industry <br> Manufacturing <br> Sector | Services <br> Sector |
| Petrochem | 23.5 | 11.0 | 51.8 |
| Electric | 32.1 | 10.1 | 47.6 |
| Electronic | 31.3 | 8.9 | 50.2 |
| Commerce | 44.5 | 5.1 | 43.2 |
| Comms | 40.6 | 9.3 | 42.3 |
| Finance | 36.6 | 4.2 | 50.5 |

See details in Exhibit 8 at Appendix 4.
(d) The petrochemical, electrical products and electronic products industries have high employment spill-over effects, in particular to the services sector. This suggests that as these industries move up the value chain, there is a growing demand for efficient intermediate service inputs into their production structure. The growth of these industries will thus be vital to the employment growth of the services sector (Exhibit 3).
(e) Among the services industries, the commerce industry benefited the most, with the highest number of jobs created as a result of a $\$ 1$ billion increase in final demand in all the manufacturing industries. (Exhibits 5, 6 and 7 in Appendix 4.) This suggests that the employment linkages between the manufacturing sector and the commerce industry is the strongest compared to other services industries. This could be due to increasing use of marketing, wholesale and retail services by the manufacturing sector.

## STRUCTURAL CHANGES IN EMPLOYMENT CREATION: INDUSTRY ANALYSIS

Since the Asian crisis, the manufacturing and services industries in Singapore have undergone major structural changes in employment creation. This can be identified in the change in percentage share of jobs created between 1995 and 2000 compared to that between 2000 and 2004.
(f) Between 1995 and 2000, there was a decrease in the share of jobs created within the same industry for most of the manufacturing and services industries (Exhibit 4). This shows that an increase in final demand in an industry generated higher spill-over effects through employment creation in other industries in 2000 than in 1995. This trend is particularly strong in petrochemical, electronic products and communications industries. This could have been due to increasing global competition and the hollowing-out of lower value-added industries as well as increased production fragmentation leading to greater use of service links.

Change in percentage share of total job created in SINGAPORE FOR SELECTED INDUSTRIES BETWEEN 1995 AND 2000 AND BETWEEN 2000 AND 2004
[Exhibit 4]

| Increase in Final Demand in | Column (4) <br> Change in Share of Total Jobs Created in (Between 1995 \& 2000) |  |  | Column (5) <br> Change in Share of Total Jobs Created in (Between 2000 \& 2004) |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | Own Industry | Manufacturing Sector | Services Sector | Own Industry | Manufacturing Sector | Services Sector |
| Petrochem | -16.7 | 2.7 | 11.3 | 1.4 | -0.4 | -0.3 |
| Electronic | -18.1 | 2.2 | 13.5 | -4.3 | -0.3 | 4.2 |
| Medical | -12.4 | 1.6 | 9.07 | 0.0 | -0.4 | 0.6 |
| Commerce | -9.5 | 0.9 | 7.6 | -0.7 | -0.1 | 1.0 |
| Comms | -10.3 | 1.8 | 7.3 | -0.9 | 0.9 | 0.3 |

See details in Exhibit 8 at Appendix 4.
(g) Between 2000 and 2004, the change in the share of jobs created in the same industry continued on a decreasing trend for most of the manufacturing industries. However, only two of the five services industries examined in this paper experience a similar change, (Exhibit 8 in Appendix 4). This implies that over time, there is increasing spillover effects in general for the manufacturing industries through creation of more jobs in the services industries.
(h) In general, the results from the post Asian crisis period of 2000 2004 suggest that the inter- and intra-industry change in the share of total jobs created was much lower for most of the manufacturing and services industries than that observed for the period 1995 2000. The effects of the restructuring process on employment seem to be levelling off to a steady state equilibrium. We could observe this trend in the petrochemical, medical and financial industries as the economy transits to higher value-added activities to sustain the GDP growth (Exhibit 4).

## POLICY IMPLICATIONS AND CONCLUSION

In summary, our findings reveal the presence of strong employment linkages between different sectors of the economy, especially from the manufacturing to services sectors, but less so in the reverse direction. Such intermediate demand for services by the manufacturing industries would be a key driver towards increasing employment linkages and job creation in the services sector.

On the whole, though new jobs will still be created in the manufacturing sector, the service sector will continue to contribute a larger share of all jobs created. Based on our findings, a rise in services employment can be seen with an associated parallel shift towards service (non-production) activities within the manufacturing labour force itself. Given the potential healthy employment growth in the services sector in the future, it is likely that increased linkages between the manufacturing and services sectors will be a key thrust of employment growth for the latter.

Cho, Byung-Do, Jungyul Sohn and Geoffrey J. D. Hewings (2000), "Industrial Structural Change in the Korean Economy between 1975 and 1995: Input-Output Analysis, The Bank of Korea Economic Papers, 3 (1), pp. 109-136.

Franke, Reiner and Peter Kalmbach (2005), "Structural Change in the Manufacturing Sector and its Impact on Business-Related Services: An InputOutput Study for Germany", Structural Change and Economic Dynamics, 16 (4), pp. 467-488.

Greenhalgh, Christine and Mary Gregory (2001), "Structural Change and the Emergence of the New Service Economy", Oxford Bulletin of Economics and Statistics, 63 (Special Issue), pp. 629-646.

Guerrieri, Paolo and Valentina Maliciani (2005), "Technology and International Competitiveness: The Interdependence between Manufacturing and Producer Services", Structural Change and Economic Dynamics, 16 (4), pp. 489-502.

Ministry of Manpower, Singapore (2004), "Singapore's Labour Market: Trends and Challenges", in Bhaskaran, Manu (ed.), The Third Singapore Economic Roundtable, SNP Media Asia \& Institute of Policy Studies, Singapore, pp. 53-72.

Toh Mun Heng and Linda Low (1994), Input-Output Tables 1988: Models and Applications, Department of Statistics, Singapore.

## APPENDIX 1

## SOURCES OF DATA

Input-Output tables for 1995 and 2000 from MTI were used to compute the total output multipliers.

Employment data based on administrative records from MRSD Data Warehouse was used in conjunction with the total output multipliers to obtain the total employment multipliers.

For the employment multipliers for 2004, where the input-output tables are unavailable from MTI, it is first assumed that the economic structure of 2004 stays the same as in 2000 so that the output multipliers for 2000 are equivalent to that of 2004, ceteris paribus. With the use of the GDP figures from the Singapore Yearbook of Statistics 2005 for the entire economy, we obtain the final demand figures for the entire economy and proportionally break it down into 18 industries for the analysis.

## FRAMEWORK

## NOTATION

The following notations will be adopted in explaining the methodology used to construct the closed model employment multipliers:
$X_{i}$ : total sales (or output) of sector $i$
$X_{j}$ : total purchases (or inputs) of sector $j\left(X_{i}=X_{j}\right.$ for $\left.i=j\right)$
$X_{i j}$ : sales of intermediate goods by sector $i$ to sector $j$
$C_{i}$ : personal consumption expenditure of goods and services produced by sector $i$
$F_{i} \quad: \quad$ value of output sold by sector $i$ for final demand excluding personal consumption expenditure
$W_{j}$ : remuneration paid out by sector $j$
$a_{i j}$ : amount of input from sector i required by sector $j$ in order to produce a dollar of output, where $a_{i j}=X_{i j} / X_{j}$

## METHODOLOGY

We make use of the input-output approach as found in Toh and Low (1994) and Department of Statistics, Singapore (1997) to compute the Leontief-Keynes output multipliers and the subsequent employment multipliers.

For illustration purposes, we consider an economy with 3 sectors together with personal consumption. From the above notation, we can denote the system of equations linking total output with intermediate and final demand as follows:

$$
\begin{aligned}
& X_{1}=X_{11}+X_{12}+X_{13}+C_{1}+F_{1} \\
& X_{2}=X_{21}+X_{22}+X_{23}+C_{2}+F_{2} \\
& X_{3}=X_{31}+X_{32}+X_{33}+C_{3}+F_{3} \\
& W=W_{1}+W_{2}+W_{3}
\end{aligned}
$$

The above equations can be rewritten as the following (note that $X_{i j}=$ $a_{i j} X_{j}$ ):

$$
\begin{aligned}
& X_{1}=a_{11} X_{1}+a_{12} X_{2}+a_{13} X_{3}+a_{14} W+F_{1} \\
& X_{2}=a_{21} X_{1}+a_{22} X_{2}+a_{23} X_{3}+a_{34} W+F_{2} \\
& X_{3}=a_{31} X_{1}+a_{32} X_{2}+a_{33} X_{3}+a_{34} W+F_{3} \\
& W=a_{41} X_{1}+a_{42} X_{2}+a_{43} X_{3}
\end{aligned}
$$

Expressing this in matrix form, we have:

$$
X=A X+F
$$

where:
$X=\left[\begin{array}{l}X_{i} \\ X_{2} \\ X_{3} \\ W\end{array}\right], A=\left[\begin{array}{llll}a_{11} & a_{12} & a_{13} & a_{14} \\ a_{21} & a_{22} & a_{23} & a_{24} \\ a_{31} & a_{32} & a_{33} & a_{34} \\ a_{41} & a_{42} & a_{43} & 0\end{array}\right], F=\left[\begin{array}{c}F_{1} \\ F_{2} \\ F_{3} \\ 0\end{array}\right]$
$X-A X=F$
$X(1-A)=F$
$x=(1-A)^{-1} F$
where I denotes the $4 \times 4$ identity matrix. The matrix $(1-A)^{-1}$ is known as the Leontief output multiplier matrix, where each entry in the matrix indicates the total output generated arising from per S\$1m of final demand from sector $i$.

To obtain the corresponding employment multipliers, we first obtain the employment to total output ratio for each sector $i$ by dividing the employment figure for sector $i$ by the corresponding total output figure. Denote this ratio as $e_{i}$. Multiplying every entry in the (I-A) ${ }^{-1}$ matrix by $e_{i}$ will yield the corresponding employment multiplier.

## INDUSTRY CLASSIFICATIONS

18 distinct industrial sectors were considered in the analysis (11 Manufacturing, 5 Services, Construction and Others). The abbreviations apply for tables found in Appendix 4.

|  | Description |
| :--- | :--- |
| Food | Food, Beverage and Tobacco |
| Textiles | Textile and Wearing Apparel |
| Paper | Paper Products and Printing |
| Petrochem | Petroleum, Chemical, Rubber and Plastics |
| Fab Metal | Fabricated Metal Products |
| Mach | Machinery and Equipment |
| Electric | Electrical Products |
| Electronic | Electronic Products |
| Medical | Medical and Precision Instruments |
| Trans | Transport Equipment |
| Other Mfg | Other Manufacturing |
| Commerce | Wholesale \& Retail Trade and Hotels \& Restaurants |
| Comms | Transport, Storage and Communications |
| Finance | Financial Intermediation |
| RE \& Biz | Real Estate and Business Services |
| CSPS | Community, Social and Personal Services |
| Construct | Construction |
| Others | Agriculture, Mining \& Quarrying, Utilities, Domestic Workers, |
|  | Owner-Occupied Dwellings |


|  | Increases Overall Employment in (Sector) by |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| S\$1 Billion Increase in Final Demand in (Sector) | 안 | $\begin{aligned} & \frac{\tilde{0}}{\overline{=}} \\ & \text { ® } \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & \stackrel{亠 凶}{0} \\ & \stackrel{0}{0} \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & \varepsilon \\ & 0 \\ & \text { ¢ } \\ & \text { og } \\ & \text { a } \\ & \hline \end{aligned}$ |  | $\begin{aligned} & \stackrel{ড}{\sim} \\ & \sum_{\Sigma} \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & \overline{\widetilde{~}} \\ & \text { U } \\ & \text { U } \\ & \hline \end{aligned}$ |  |  | $\begin{aligned} & \text { n } \\ & \stackrel{n}{\Pi} \end{aligned}$ |  |  | $\stackrel{\tilde{n}}{\underline{0}}$ | $\begin{aligned} & \stackrel{y}{\check{N}} \\ & \stackrel{\text { 든 }}{ } \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & \stackrel{N}{\infty} \\ & \infty \\ & \underset{\sim}{\infty} \\ & \hline \end{aligned}$ | $\underset{\sim}{\hat{\omega}}$ |  | $\begin{aligned} & \stackrel{n}{\omega} \\ & \stackrel{y}{5} \end{aligned}$ | ¢ |
| Food | 4,881.9 | 31.8 | 232.2 | 36.0 | 185.4 | 28.2 | 7.1 | 14.5 | 2.1 | 38.0 | 139.4 | 1901.7 | 401.2 | 132.7 | 539.7 | 538.5 | 67.1 | 663.3 | 9,840.3 |
| Textiles | 73.6 | 15,802 | 122.5 | 27.9 | 26.5 | 16.9 | 7.1 | 14.2 | 1.4 | 38.0 | 44.1 | 1,685.7 | 436.9 | 165.1 | 480.8 | 597.4 | 71.1 | 722.1 | 20,333.3 |
| Paper | 55.1 | 40.6 | 7,543.3 | 38.4 | 25.4 | 20.8 | 9.4 | 15.3 | 2.0 | 40.1 | 43.1 | 1,689.6 | 442.3 | 145.7 | 548.3 | 636.8 | 76.7 | 722.6 | 12,095.3 |
| Petrochem | 20.6 | 14.4 | 52.9 | 1,443.7 | 42.8 | 11.5 | 3.9 | 6.1 | 0.7 | 17.7 | 31.8 | 660.6 | 187.5 | 74.8 | 255.1 | 242.4 | 36.0 | 375.5 | 3,478.0 |
| Fab Metal | 49.6 | 33.4 | 109.3 | 29.4 | 4,239.5 | 65.0 | 19.7 | 47.5 | 7.9 | 51.6 | 238.3 | 1,567.5 | 417.5 | 134.3 | 514.6 | 592.2 | 76.6 | 694.2 | 8,887.9 |
| Mach | 54.7 | 44.9 | 115.2 | 29.2 | 122.6 | 7,904.1 | 16.8 | 20.6 | 7.7 | 63.7 | 151.3 | 1,675.3 | 485.9 | 157.6 | 601.9 | 658.0 | 79.8 | 732.5 | 12,921.6 |
| Electrical | 41.6 | 28.5 | 142.5 | 32.3 | 145.4 | 52.9 | 4,108.7 | 55.3 | 5.7 | 37.7 | 57.5 | 1,380.8 | 360.9 | 121.8 | 422.9 | 485.4 | 59. | 582.6 | 8,122.2 |
| Electronic | 18.4 | 22.5 | 58.3 | 18.9 | 33.2 | 10.2 | 18.5 | 2,244.3 | 1.5 | 15.1 | 34.4 | 641.4 | 165.0 | 77.5 | 212.8 | 228.3 | 25.8 | 249.2 | 4,075.2 |
| Medical | 45.7 | 29.3 | 112.5 | 38.9 | 87.7 | 24.1 | 9.7 | 29.3 | 6,904.8 | 34.6 | 117.4 | 1,453.1 | 393.5 | 146.2 | 411.3 | 516.1 | 61.9 | 625.4 | 11,041.6 |
| Trans | 64.6 | 54.4 | 117.9 | 32.4 | 127.0 | 158.7 | 22.9 | 26.6 | 9.0 | 11,385.0 | 158.7 | 1,770.7 | 515.6 | 182.7 | 715.1 | 786.8 | 101.8 | 885.6 | 17,115.0 |
| Other Mfg | 47.3 | 41.3 | 118.8 | 35.2 | 63.2 | 20.7 | 11.5 | 14.0 | 4.8 | 39.2 | 7,525.0 | 1,651.9 | 399.3 | 132.5 | 460.3 | 552.2 | 83.5 | 813.4 | 12,013.9 |
| Commerce | 150.8 | 70.7 | 203.7 | 41.2 | 39.3 | 35.1 | 10.6 | 18.9 | 2.1 | 94.0 | 59.3 | 11,472.0 | 1,273.4 | 351.8 | 1,267.7 | 1,001.9 | 94.4 | 1,013.2 | 17,199. |
| Comms | 55.2 | 53.6 | 99.8 | 27.5 | 20.7 | 36.8 | 6.1 | 11.8 | 1.2 | 343.3 | 33.9 | 1,072.1 | 6,513.8 | 157.6 | 551.0 | 759.0 | 59. | 659.9 | 10,462 |
| Finance | 51.2 | 32. | 127.0 | 18.3 | 18.4 | 17.3 | 6.1 | 13.8 | 1.1 | 44.1 | 33.7 | 1,077.8 | 453.2 | 4,350.6 | 772.9 | 748.5 | 61.9 | 679.1 | 8,507.7 |
| RE \& Biz | 58.4 | 53.7 | 220.5 | 30.6 | 54 | 84.8 | 10.0 | 17.4 | 1.4 | 68.5 | 61.8 | 1,385.4 | 628.7 | 204.6 | 7,328.6 | 835.1 | 152.2 | 786.8 | 11,982.8 |
| CSPS | 109.6 | 98.7 | 208.1 | 43.7 | 93.2 | 43.9 | 15.7 | 26.8 | 4.4 | 309.4 | 86.5 | 2,226.5 | 690.0 | 230.7 | 1,205.3 | 13,057.0 | 157.2 | 1,347.4 | 19,953. |
| Construct | 59.5 | 40.8 | 98.9 | 52.8 | 184.5 | 105.2 | 20.3 | 17.5 | 2.5 | 44.9 | 740.8 | 1,591.5 | 437.2 | 154.8 | 788 | 623.7 | 12,397.0 | 763.2 | 18,124.0 |
| thers | 56.9 | 42.1 | 90.9 | 116.6 | 30.5 | 19.7 | 7.6 | 11.4 | 1.0 | 35.8 | 65.7 | 1,038.6 | 324.7 | 107.6 | 661.4 | 69.9 | 569.0 | 11,410.0 | 15,281.6 |

[^3]|  | Increases Overall Employment in (Sector) by |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| S\$1 Billion Increase in Final Demand in (Sector) | 응 |  | $\begin{aligned} & \bar{\otimes} \\ & \stackrel{\rightharpoonup}{0} \\ & \hline \end{aligned}$ |  | $\begin{aligned} & \overline{\widetilde{T}} \\ & \stackrel{\sim}{2} \\ & \stackrel{0}{\sim} \\ & \stackrel{0}{\sim} \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & \text { ᄃ } \\ & \underset{\Sigma}{N} \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & \bar{U} \\ & \stackrel{U}{U} \\ & \text { 区 } \end{aligned}$ |  | $\begin{aligned} & \overline{\mathbb{U}} \\ & \stackrel{\rightharpoonup}{0} \\ & \sum \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & \widetilde{\widetilde{0}} \\ & \stackrel{N}{V} \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & \text { O } \\ & \sum^{2} \\ & \overline{\#} \\ & \stackrel{\#}{5} \end{aligned}$ |  | $\begin{aligned} & \tilde{\varepsilon}_{1}^{\varepsilon} \\ & 0 \\ & 0 \end{aligned}$ | U $\stackrel{\text { ¢ }}{\text { c }}$ 든 | $\begin{aligned} & \stackrel{N}{\infty} \\ & \infty \\ & \underset{\propto}{w} \end{aligned}$ | $\stackrel{\sim}{\imath}$ | $\Psi$ <br>  <br>  <br> 0 |  | を |
| Food | 5,691.2 | 27.2 | 223.6 | 53.7 | 203.4 | 49.4 | 6.0 | 19.0 | 4.5 | 65.4 | 116.6 | 2,121.3 | 567.6 | 307.3 | 817.0 | 440.3 | 97.4 | 772.3 | 11,583.0 |
| Textiles | 102.3 | 10,069.0 | 119.9 | 41.0 | 32.6 | 30.2 | 5.5 | 16.9 | 2.8 | 63.0 | 44.3 | 1,810.1 | 581.8 | 357.5 | 717.3 | 458.2 | 98.6 | 789.1 | 15,339.5 |
| Paper | 64.6 | 34.1 | 7,431.7 | 61.0 | 31.3 | 37.3 | 7.7 | 19.2 | 4.4 | 67.4 | 43.2 | 1,860.7 | 601.3 | 323.0 | 828.3 | 506.2 | 109.0 | 814.2 | 12,844.6 |
| Petrochem | 25.7 | 12.2 | 56.7 | 912.7 | 51.4 | 20.9 | 3.4 | 8.0 | 1.6 | 30.6 | 30.9 | 760.8 | 267.2 | 177.3 | 392.9 | 203.6 | 53.1 | 446.8 | 3,455.7 |
| Fab Metal | 56.9 | 27.3 | 111.8 | 42.8 | 3,725.5 | 106.6 | 16.9 | 64.4 | 16.7 | 79.1 | 222.1 | 1,691.3 | 556.9 | 294.1 | 755.5 | 461.2 | 106.6 | 768.4 | 9,104.0 |
| Mach | 62.4 | 36.5 | 119.1 | 40.9 | 137.1 | 7,788.8 | 14.1 | 26.4 | 16.3 | 96.3 | 144.4 | 1,797.9 | 643.6 | 343.1 | 876.0 | 511.5 | 111.3 | 809.8 | 13,575.4 |
| Electrical | 48.4 | 23.5 | 137.8 | 43.2 | 159.8 | 86.4 | 3,109.8 | 75.0 | 11.9 | 60.5 | 56.1 | 1,500.5 | 485.9 | 270.2 | 628.7 | 380.8 | 84.2 | 650.4 | 7,813.0 |
| Electronic | 23.4 | 19.7 | 60.3 | 23.2 | 39.1 | 18.8 | 16.6 | 1,392.7 | 3.3 | 27.1 | 33.2 | 744.6 | 239.7 | 183.5 | 337.3 | 195.4 | 39.0 | 300.3 | 3,697.2 |
| Medical | 53.2 | 24.1 | 111.7 | 48.9 | 99.2 | 42.0 | 8.1 | 39.5 | 4,955.6 | 58.3 | 99.8 | 1,584.9 | 531.5 | 325.0 | 623.4 | 406.0 | 88.1 | 701.5 | 9,800.8 |
| Trans | 70.8 | 43.3 | 119.2 | 46.5 | 142.7 | 256.1 | 19.3 | 34.0 | 19.1 | 11,389.0 | 173.6 | 1,850.2 | 664.8 | 386.0 | 1,018.2 | 596.1 | 139.4 | 957.2 | 17,925.3 |
| Other Mfg | 56.9 | 36.2 | 121.8 | 55.6 | 71.3 | 39.0 | 9.4 | 17.5 | 9.0 | 67.8 | 7,964.3 | 1,815.0 | 559.9 | 300.7 | 736.3 | 478.7 | 119.6 | 932.9 | 13,392.0 |
| Commerce | 172.3 | 56.1 | 206.3 | 55.8 | 44.0 | 60.2 | 8.0 | 21.9 | 4.1 | 154.9 | 55.2 | 9,489.9 | 1,572.8 | 737.9 | 1,719.0 | 772.1 | 130.2 | 1,093.6 | 16,354.4 |
| Comms | 63.3 | 45.1 | 106.1 | 42.7 | 25.7 | 65.4 | 4.9 | 14.3 | 2.5 | 457.7 | 35.5 | 1,126.7 | 5,687.0 | 347.2 | 814.1 | 618.8 | 86.5 | 744.2 | 10,287.7 |
| Finance | 57.7 | 26.9 | 141.2 | 27.5 | 22.0 | 31.8 | 4.8 | 17.2 | 2.2 | 73.2 | 34.0 | 1,131.7 | 613.0 | 4,867.4 | 1,167.8 | 621.1 | 92.2 | 779.6 | 9,711.3 |
| RE \& Biz | 64.5 | 44.2 | 238.1 | 46.3 | 63.7 | 142.4 | 8.2 | 21.5 | 2.9 | 107.9 | 60.4 | 1,447.4 | 824.5 | 446.3 | 9,653.3 | 663.3 | 208.7 | 873.2 | 14,916.7 |
| CSPS | 117.7 | 78.1 | 206.8 | 63.6 | 105.6 | 74.2 | 12.2 | 31.2 | 9.2 | 404.2 | 84.3 | 2,202.0 | 845.7 | 458.2 | 1,665.4 | 11,208.0 | 212.7 | 1,427.1 | 19,206.4 |
| Construct | 65.4 | 32.2 | 99.5 | 80.0 | 210.4 | 175.1 | 17.3 | 21.7 | 5.2 | 70.0 | 624.0 | 1,662.9 | 565.2 | 327.1 | 1,123.9 | 464.9 | 14,123.0 | 823.3 | 20,491.2 |
| Others | 69.3 | 35.9 | 100.0 | 156.1 | 39.5 | 36.9 | 6.1 | 14.0 | 2.2 | 57.9 | 66.7 | 1,152.2 | 443.9 | 242.6 | 986.3 | 567.5 | 777.7 | 12,129.0 | 16,883.9 |

*Computation based on closed I-O model for 2000.
EMPLOYMENT GENERATED FOR $\$ 1$ BILLION INCREASE IN FINAL DEMAND — 2004
[Exhibit 7]
Increases Overall Employment in (Sector) by

|  | Increases Overall Employment in (Sector) by |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| S\$1 Billion Increase in Final Demand in (Sector) | 은 |  | $\begin{aligned} & \bar{\omega} \\ & \stackrel{\rightharpoonup}{0} \\ & \hline \end{aligned}$ |  | $\begin{aligned} & \overline{\widetilde{0}} \\ & \sum_{\sim}^{\sim} \\ & \stackrel{0}{\widetilde{\sim}} \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & \stackrel{N}{0} \\ & \underset{\Sigma}{2} \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & \bar{U} \\ & \stackrel{U}{U} \\ & \text { 区 } \end{aligned}$ | U 은 U U | $\begin{aligned} & \overline{\mathbb{U}} \\ & \overline{0} \\ & \sum \sum \end{aligned}$ |  |  |  | $\begin{aligned} & n \\ & \varepsilon \\ & \vdots \\ & 0 \end{aligned}$ |  | $\begin{aligned} & \stackrel{N}{\infty} \\ & \infty \\ & \underset{\sim}{\sim} \end{aligned}$ | $\underset{\sim}{\hat{v}}$ |  | N $\stackrel{\text { ¢ }}{ \pm}$ 0 | な |
| Food | 6,255.5 | 22.5 | 168.1 | 58.0 | 178.7 | 46.8 | 4.3 | 15.4 | 4.4 | 85.1 | 97.8 | 2,065.6 | 558.2 | 310.1 | 866.9 | 472.1 | 67.7 | 769.7 | 12,046.9 |
| Textiles | 112.4 | 8,360.0 | 90.2 | 44.2 | 28.7 | 28.6 | 4.0 | 13.7 | 2.7 | 81.9 | 37.1 | 1,762.5 | 572.1 | 360.8 | 761.1 | 491.3 | 68.6 | 786.4 | 13,606.9 |
| Paper | 71.0 | 28.3 | 5,586.7 | 65.8 | 27.5 | 35.3 | 5.6 | 15.6 | 4.3 | 87.7 | 36.3 | 1,811.8 | 591.3 | 326.0 | 878.8 | 542.8 | 75.8 | 811.4 | 11,002.1 |
| Petrochem | 28.2 | 10.2 | 42.6 | 985.0 | 45.2 | 19.8 | 2.5 | 6.5 | 1.6 | 39.9 | 25.9 | 740.8 | 262.8 | 178.9 | 416.8 | 218.3 | 36.9 | 445.3 | 3,507.2 |
| Fab Metal | 62.5 | 22.6 | 84.0 | 46.2 | 3,272.9 | 100.9 | 12.3 | 52.2 | 16.5 | 102.9 | 186.3 | 1,646.9 | 547.6 | 296.8 | 801.7 | 494.6 | 74.1 | 765.9 | 8,587.0 |
| Mach | 68.5 | 30.3 | 89.5 | 44.1 | 120.5 | 7,372.1 | 10.3 | 21.4 | 16.1 | 125.3 | 121.2 | 1,750.7 | 633.0 | 346.2 | 929.5 | 548.5 | 77.4 | 807.0 | 13,111.5 |
| Electrical | 53.2 | 19.5 | 103.6 | 46.7 | 140.3 | 81.8 | 2,264.9 | 60.8 | 11.8 | 78.7 | 47.0 | 1,461.1 | 477.8 | 272.7 | 667.1 | 408.3 | 58.5 | 648.2 | 6,902.1 |
| Electronic | 25.7 | 16.3 | 45.3 | 25.1 | 34.4 | 17.8 | 12.1 | 1,129.5 | 3.2 | 35.3 | 27.9 | 725.0 | 235.8 | 185.2 | 357.9 | 209.6 | 27.1 | 299.3 | 3,412.4 |
| Medical | 58.5 | 20.0 | 84.0 | 52.8 | 87.2 | 39.8 | 5.9 | 32.0 | 4,892.0 | 75.8 | 83.7 | 1,543.3 | 522.7 | 328.0 | 661.4 | 435.3 | 61.3 | 699.1 | 9,682.8 |
| Trans | 77.8 | 36.0 | 89.6 | 50.2 | 125.4 | 242.4 | 14.1 | 27.6 | 18.9 | 14,817.0 | 145.6 | 1,801.6 | 653.8 | 389.5 | 1,080.4 | 639.2 | 96.9 | 954.0 | 21,259.7 |
| Other Mfg | 62.6 | 30.1 | 91.6 | 60.0 | 62.6 | 36.9 | 6.8 | 14.2 | 8.9 | 88.2 | 6,680.7 | 1,767.3 | 550.7 | 303.5 | 781.3 | 513.3 | 83.1 | 929.7 | $12,071.5$ |
| Commerce | 189.4 | 46.6 | 155.1 | 60.3 | 38.7 | 57.0 | 5.8 | 17.8 | 4.1 | 201.5 | 46.3 | 9,240.8 | 1,546.8 | 744.7 | 1,824.0 | 827.8 | 90.5 | 1,089.9 | 16,186.9 |
| Comms | 69.6 | 37.4 | 79.8 | 46.1 | 22.6 | 61.9 | 3.6 | 11.6 | 2.5 | 595.5 | 29.8 | 1,097.1 | 5,592.9 | 350.4 | 863.8 | 663.5 | 60.2 | 741.7 | 10,329.8 |
| Finance | 63.4 | 22.3 | 106.1 | 29.7 | 19.3 | 30.1 | 3.5 | 13.9 | 2.16 | 95.3 | 28.5 | 1,102.0 | 602.9 | 4,912.3 | 1,239.1 | 666.0 | 64.1 | 777.0 | 9,777.7 |
| RE \& Biz | 70.9 | 36.7 | 179.0 | 50.0 | 55.9 | 134.8 | 5.9 | 17.4 | 2.87 | 140.3 | 50.7 | 1,409.4 | 810.9 | 450.4 | 10,242.8 | 711.2 | 145.1 | 870.3 | 15,384.6 |
| CSPS | 129.4 | 64.9 | 155.5 | 68.7 | 92.8 | 70.3 | 8.9 | 25.3 | 9.1 | 525.8 | 70.7 | 2,144.2 | 831.7 | 462.4 | 1767.1 | 12,017.8 | 147.9 | 1,422.3 | 20,014.6 |
| Construct | 71.9 | 26.8 | 74.8 | 86.3 | 46.8 | 165.7 | 12.6 | 17.6 | 5.1 | 91.0 | 523.5 | 1,619.3 | 555.8 | 330.1 | 1,192.5 | 498.49 | 9,819.9 | 820.5 | 16,096.8 |
| Others | 76.2 | 29.8 | 75.2 | 168.5 | 34.7 | 34.9 | 4.5 | 11.3 | 2.2 | 75.3 | 55.9 | 1,121.9 | 436.6 | 244.8 | 1,046.6 | 608.5 | 540.8 | 12,088.3 | 16,655.9 |

Share of own, manufacturing and services sectors jobs and percentage change in share of jobs created arising FROM A CHANGE IN FINAL DEMAND IN EACH INDUSTRY, 1995, 2000 AND 2004
Exhibit 8]

| Increase <br> in Final Demand in | (1) <br> Share of Jobs (\%) Created in 1995 |  |  | (2) <br> Share of Jobs (\%) Created in 2000 |  |  | (3) <br> Share of Jobs (\%) Created in 2004 |  |  | (4) <br> Change in Share of Jobs (\%) <br> Created in (1995 and 2000) <br> [Column (2) - Column (1)] |  |  | (5) Change in Share of Jobs (\%) Created in (2000 and 2004) [Column (3) - Column (2)] |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | Own Industry | Mfg Sector | Services Sector | Own Industry | Mfg Sector | Services Sector | Own Industry | Mfg Sector | Services Sector | Own Industry | Mfg Sector | Services Sector | Own Industry | Mfg Sector | Services Sector |
| Food | 40.8 | 16.0 | 35.7 | 39.9 | 15.9 | 36.7 | 42.2 | 15.4 | 35.5 | -0.9 | -0.2 | 1.0 | 2.3 | -0.5 | -1.3 |
| Textile | 69.5 | 10.1 | 16.6 | 55.9 | 12.8 | 25.6 | 52.3 | 12.4 | 29.0 | -13.6 | 2.7 | 9.0 | -3.6 | -0.4 | 3.5 |
| Paper | 59.3 | 5.5 | 28.6 | 54.7 | 6.1 | 32.1 | 48.0 | 6.3 | 37.7 | -4.6 | 0.6 | 3.4 | -6.7 | 0.2 | 5.7 |
| Petrochem | 38.7 | 8.6 | 40.8 | 22.1 | 11.3 | 52.1 | 23.5 | 11.0 | 51.8 | -16.7 | 2.7 | 11.3 | 1.4 | -0.4 | -0.3 |
| Fab Metal | 43.8 | 11.3 | 36.3 | 36.7 | 12.4 | 41.3 | 34.2 | 11.9 | 44.1 | -7.0 | 1.1 | 5.0 | -2.5 | -0.5 | 2.9 |
| Mach | 58.4 | 7.6 | 27.7 | 53.3 | 9.2 | 30.7 | 52.2 | 9.0 | 32.1 | -5.2 | 1.6 | 3.0 | -1.07 | -0.3 | 1.4 |
| Electric | 49.5 | 8.4 | 34.1 | 38.9 | 9.9 | 41.8 | 32.1 | 10.1 | 47.6 | -10.7 | 1.5 | 7.7 | -6.8 | 0.2 | 5.8 |
| Electronic | 53.8 | 7.0 | 32.5 | 35.7 | 9.2 | 46.0 | 31.3 | 8.9 | 50.2 | -18.1 | 2.2 | 13.5 | -4.3 | -0.3 | 4.2 |
| Medical | 62.3 | 5.1 | 26.5 | 49.9 | 6.6 | 35.4 | 49.9 | 6.2 | 36.1 | -12.4 | 1.6 | 9.0 | 0.0 | -0.4 | 0.6 |
| Trans | 54.5 | 16.6 | 23.2 | 49.9 | 18.8 | 25.2 | 54.8 | 18.8 | 21.5 | -4.6 | 2.2 | 2.0 | 4.8 | 0.1 | -3.7 |
| Other Mfg | 55.0 | 11.0 | 26.6 | 52.7 | 10.4 | 29.1 | 49.1 | 10.1 | 32.4 | -2.2 | -0.6 | 2.5 | -3.7 | -0.3 | 3.4 |
| Commerce | 54.7 | 4.2 | 34.6 | 45.2 | 5.1 | 42.2 | 44.5 | 5.1 | 43.2 | -9.5 | 0.9 | 7.6 | -0.7 | -0.1 | 1.0 |
| Comms | 51.8 | 6.6 | 34.8 | 41.5 | 8.4 | 42.1 | 40.6 | 9.3 | 42.3 | -10.3 | 1.8 | 7.3 | -0.9 | 0.9 | 0.3 |
| Finance | 44.2 | 4.3 | 42.9 | 36.6 | 4.5 | 50.0 | 36.6 | 4.2 | 50.5 | -7.6 | 0.2 | 7.1 | 0.1 | -0.3 | 0.6 |
| RE \& Biz | 51.8 | 5.5 | 34.9 | 54.0 | 5.4 | 33.4 | 55.6 | 4.8 | 33.0 | 2.2 | -0.2 | -1.5 | 1.6 | -0.5 | -0.4 |
| CSPS | 57.4 | 5.2 | 29.8 | 52.0 | 6.2 | 33.3 | 53.5 | 6.1 | 32.6 | -5.5 | 1.0 | 3.5 | 1.5 | -0.1 | -0.7 |
| Construct | 68.0 | 7.6 | 19.8 | 68.5 | 6.8 | 20.2 | 60.6 | 7.8 | 26.1 | 0.4 | -0.7 | 0.4 | -7.9 | 1.0 | 5.9 |
| Others | 66.8 | 3.1 | 18.5 | 64.0 | 3.5 | 20.1 | 64.7 | 3.4 | 20.8 | -2.9 | 0.3 | 1.6 | 0.7 | -0.1 | 0.7 |


[^0]:    The views expressed in this paper are solely those of the authors and do not necessarily reflect those of the Ministry of Manpower, the Ministry of Trade and Industry or the Government of Singapore.

[^1]:    1 The authors would like to thank Mr Jeffrey Wong, Ms Elizabeth Quah, Mr Edward Teo, Mr Randy Tan and Professor Toh Mun Heng for their helpful comments.

[^2]:    2 Employment multipliers are calculated based on the closed model and it includes both the Leontief multiplier and Keynesian multiplier effects (direct, indirect and induced effects). Hence, the multipliers from the closed model will be larger than the open model (the open model includes only the Leontief multiplier effects). In the model, consumption of the household sector in final demand is treated as an endogenous variable, as a function of wage income since personal disposable income data is not available in Singapore.
    3 The 2004 employment multipliers are simulated based on the assumptions stated in Appendix 1.
    4 Others sector comprises agriculture, mining and quarrying, utilities, domestic work and owner-occupied dwellings.

[^3]:    *omputation based on closed l-O model for 1995.

